Contents

Acknowledgments xi
Introduction xiii

PART 1: The Language of Critique 1

Chapter 1: The Case for Critique:
Why We Need Constructive Criticism to Make Great Ads 3

  Befriending the Beast 3
  What Exactly Is Critique? 5
  Critique Is a Skill, Not a Talent . . . 7
  . . . So Let’s Teach It 8
  Print: The Ground Zero of Critique 9
    Print Is the Conceptual Bedrock of Advertising 9
    Print Is Touchable and Intimate 9
    Print Has the Power to Stop and Hold a Gaze 9
    Print Is Pure: It Doesn’t Dance or Sing—Except in Your Mind 10
  The Critique Paradox 10
  Critique Basics 11
  Further Reading 12
  Critique Exercises 12

Chapter 2: AdSpeak: The Vocabulary of Advertising 13

  Every Language Needs a Vocabulary 13

  The Basic Terms of AdSpeak: They’ll Change the Way You Judge Advertising . . . And Talk About It 15

  The Creative Strategy: AKA “The WHAT” 15
    The Four Basic Functions of an Advertising Strategy 16
    The Strategy in Action: A Facilitated Critique—Altoids 18
    The Strategy in Action: A Facilitated Critique—Bacardi 20
The Target Audience: AKA “The WHO” 23
  The Target Audience in Action: A Facilitated Critique—Dewar’s 25
The Concept: AKA “The HOW” 28
  The Concept in Action: A Facilitated Critique—American Floral Marketing Council 29
Execution 29
  The Execution in Action: A Facilitated Critique—Godiva 30
  Executonal Study—Reese’s Peanut Butter Cups 33
The Layout 37
Campaign 40
  The Campaign in Action: A Facilitated Critique—California Milk Processor Board 41
  The Campaign in Action: A Facilitated Critique—Absolut 43
  The Campaign in Action: A Facilitated Critique—Bombay Sapphire Gin 45
Tagline 46
  “Got Milk” Versus “Where’s Your Milk Moustache?” 46
  “Just Do It” Versus “Planet Reebok” 49

The More Advanced Terms of AdSpeak: Sharpen Your Tongue . . . 49
  Brand Identity and Equity 49
  “Ownability” 51
  Brand Personality 53
  Page Personality 56
  Demo: AKA “The Proof” 57
  The Terms: A Cheat Sheet 59
  Critique Exercises 60
  Suggested Viewing 60
  Suggested Reading 60

Chapter 3: AdErrors: When Good Ads Go Bad 61
  AdError One: The Headline and the Visual Are Redundant or Disconnected 62
    Example: Cask & Cream 62
  AdError Two: Meaningless Gimmicks and Borrowed Interest 64
    Example: Oscar Meyer Bacon 65
  AdError Three: Using Spokespeople Who Are Irrelevant to the Product or Message 67
    Example: Sub-Zero 67
  AdError Four: Lack of Focus 69
    Example: Kitchen Basics 69
  AdError Five: The Page Is Overdeveloped and/or Poorly Planned 71
    Example: Conair 71
AdError Six: Sacrificing Clarity for Cleverness 72
   Example: Birds Eye 72
AdError Seven: Overacknowledging Your Competition 73
   Example: Smirnoff 73
AdError Eight: Letting Your Strategy Show 75
   Example: Myrtle Beach, South Carolina 75
AdError Nine: Being Edgy for Its Own Sake 76
   Example: Smith Micro 76
AdError Ten: Huh? Using Pretzel Logic, Being Too Subtle or Obtuse 77
   Example: Ricoh 77
AdError Eleven: Forgetting About the Product 79
   Example: Millstone Coffee 79
AdError Twelve: Being Boring or Too Obvious 80
   Examples: Northland Juice and Cetaphil 81
AdError Thirteen: The Tonality and/or Visual Style Is Inconsistent
   With the Product or Message 82
   Example: NicoDerm 82
Critique Exercises 83

Chapter 4: AdAnalogy: How Art and Copy Play Together 85
   Why Are Single-Panel Cartoons Funny? 85
   Funny? Unfunny? How Cartoons Work 89
   Headline Swap: How Print Ads Work 95
   Critique Exercises 101
   Suggested Reading 101
   Great Collections of Single-Panel Cartoons 102

Chapter 5: The 360-Degree Critique: Being Digital,
   Going Viral, and Beyond 103
   Defining Our Media Channels 105
      Print 105
      Broadcast 105
      Hybrids 106
      Digital 107
      Everything Else—Or That Catchall Category: “Alternative Media” 108
   Timeline and Traits of Media Channels 112
   AdSpeak 360 114
      Case Study: The California Milk Processor Board’s “Got Milk?” From Print to
      Television to Out-of-Home/Experiential 115
      Case Study: Dove’s “Real Beauty” Campaign:
      From Print to Television to Viral to Digital to Social Media 122
Case Study: Old Spice’s “Smell Like a Man, Man”: TV to Social Media to Print 129
It’s a 360-Degree World: Respect Your Media 134
Critique Exercises 135
Find Out More 136

PART 2: Critique in Action 137

Chapter 6: AdAlliances: Your Partners in Creating Great Advertising 139

The Dance 139
The Cast of Characters 139
Knee-Jerk Reactions to Those on the Other Side of the Table 141
Stories From the Combat Zone 144
Two Sides to Every Stereotype 147
Critique Exercises 149
Suggested Reading 149

Chapter 7: AdSpeak Up! Who Says What When 151

The Cast of Characters 151
The Basic Chronology of the Process 152
Strategy 152
Concept 153
Execution 155
Layout 157
Production 158
Critique Exercise—in Four Parts 159

Chapter 8: The Creative Team’s Bill of Rights 161

The Creative Team’s Bill of Rights: Eight Things Every Art Director and Copywriter Have a Right to Expect During the Presentation of Their Work 162
Amendment One 162
Amendment Two 162
Amendment Three 163
Amendment Four 164
Amendment Five 165
Amendment Six 166
Amendment Seven 167
Amendment Eight 168
Chapter 9: The Client's Bill of Rights

The Client's Bill of Rights: Six Things Every Client Has a Right to Expect During a Creative Presentation

- Amendment One
- Amendment Two
- Amendment Three
- Amendment Four
- Amendment Five
- Amendment Six

Recap
Suggested Viewing
Critique Exercises

Chapter 10: Presentation Prep

Prior to the Meeting

1. Agree on a reasonable timetable for creative development (or appreciate the constraints and consequent compromises of an unreasonable one)
2. Agree to provide significant information and insights at the beginning of the process instead of in drips and drabs during the process
3. Agree that unexpected discoveries happen . . . and schedules need to be adjusted accordingly
4. Agree on the explicit purpose of the meeting
5. Agree on the form that the presentation material will take
6. Agree on the limitations of the meeting
7. Make sure that everyone who will be attending the meeting is on the same page and has the same agenda
8. Walk in knowledgeable

Recap
Suggested Reading